"We are Living in a Forgotten Place": Safety in the Cross-Border Parts of the City of Tshwane

by

Ingrid Palmary & Kindiza Ngubeni

Research report written for the Centre for the Study of Violence and Reconciliation, October 2003.

Ingrid Palmary is a former Researcher in the City Safety Project at the Centre for the Study of Violence and Reconciliation.

Kindiza Ngubeni is a Senior Community Facilitator in the Criminal Justice Programme at the Centre for the Study of Violence and Reconciliation.

1. Introduction

This report is based on research that was undertaken in the City of Tshwane. South African metropolitan areas have, in recent years, had crime prevention high on the agenda. This is seen in the emphasis that has been placed in recent times on the development metropolitan police services in five of the six category A municipalities. Given that their functions include by-law enforcement and that their primary crime prevention function is visible policing they have been seen to be effective for densely populated, urban areas where police visibility and urban decay are priorities. These are activities with a history of success internationally (Osgood and Chambers, 2000). However, within these metropolitan boundaries, Tshwane has fairly large areas that are more accurately described as rural or peri-urban. These areas, formerly part of the
Bophuthatswana 'independent' homeland, are on the outskirts of the city and are historically very under-resourced areas. It is likely that these areas will require a different approach to crime reduction to the more urban and suburban parts of the City. This presents a challenge to cities that have a predominantly urban-based crime expertise and focus. In addition, these areas have not historically been a part of the city and were only included in the City of Tshwane after the 2001 elections. This means that service delivery in these areas is a relatively new responsibility for the City of Tshwane and will require the city to form new partnerships and strategies, especially in light of their historical disadvantage.

For the purposes of this research four areas in the Tshwane metro were selected. They are GaRankuwa, Mabopane, Winterveld and Temba. These areas were selected for a number of reasons. On the whole, their land use is more rural than the rest of Tshwane. However, they are diverse with GaRankuwa and Mabopane being smaller, more densely populated areas where people rely on a combination of rural and urban economic activities. Temba and Winterveld on the other hand are more rural, are further from the city and surrounding suburbs, and their residents rely more heavily on rural economic activities, including small scale farming and work on large neighbouring farms (see section 3). The contrast in these areas is important in understanding crime, the likely predictors of crime in each area and its underlying facilitators. Secondly, each of these areas is a cross-border area, that is, they all fall within the Tshwane Metro but are within the North West Province. As the rest of Tshwane is in Gauteng, this means that service delivery to these areas takes place across provincial boundaries and requires a great deal of collaboration between provinces and between the city and the two provinces.

This report reflects on how the unique characteristics of these four areas impacts on crime in the Metro. It also provides an overview of existing crime prevention activities in these areas and considers the gaps and opportunities for intervention by both government and civil society. This report is intended to assist local government and communities in planning crime prevention for these areas.

2. Methodology

This research is a qualitative review of key crime prevention activities in the cross-border, rural areas of the Tshwane metro in order to assist local government and community in planning and refining crime prevention activities. It therefore began with meetings with the City of Tshwane in order to determine the information that was most valuable to them. One of the most important issues raised in this meeting was the lack of information that local government had about what communities are willing to do about crime and what they are already doing, with or without government assistance.

The research therefore included key informant interviews with a range of individuals and groups involved in crime prevention. This varied a great deal in the different parts of the cross-border areas with some areas having no activities outside of a police station and others having several community structures involved in crime prevention. Interviews included:

- Magistrates courts
- South African Police services
- Tshwane Metropolitan Police Service
- Community leaders and tribal authorities
Councillors (although not all could be contacted at this stage)
Community initiatives
NGO projects

Difficulties were experienced in contacting some people for this research. Firstly, not all places had telephones and in some cases even the telephones of police stations were not working. Also, getting directions was difficult as few areas have street names or tarred roads and this made meetings very time consuming and limited the number of interviews that could be done in a day. Also, there was very little direct service delivery in these areas by NGOs or government. As a result, most of the local projects that we came to hear about happened between small informal groups of people. This means that there is the possibility that we did not manage to contact all of these groups. Finally, the long distances travelled to access some of these areas and our position as a Johannesburg based NGO will have impacted on our understanding of the area and will have affected the information that we received from participants. In some cases this was an advantage as people were willing to explain in great detail some of the dynamics of their community which otherwise may have been taken for granted. On another level it may result in less in-depth information. Either way, this is an issue that plagues all research, particularly research which involves a degree of analysis of community activities. In order to manage this, the report has been sent to numerous stakeholders as well as research participants for comment and to flesh out certain points raised.

3. Background to cross-border areas in Tshwane

3.1 The history of cross-border Tshwane

The parts of Tshwane considered for this study are Temba, Winterveld, Mabopane and GaRankuwa. Each of these areas was incorporated into the Tshwane metro following the 2001 municipal elections. In addition, each was part of the Former Bophuthatswana until 1993. As a so called 'independent' homeland, created under apartheid, Bophuthatswana had completely independent structures for maintaining safety and security such as police, military, air force and army, although these remained under the control of the SANDF. The Bophuthatswana Defence Force (BDF) were deployed on several occasions in the 1980s and 1990s mostly to suppress demonstrations by residents who had been part of 'South Africa' prior to the establishment of the homeland system but also to suppress a coup attempt against Lawrence Lucas Manyana Mangope who was later reinstated by the apartheid government. Support for Mangope, and his leadership was mixed (Colombia Encyclopaedia, 2003) as was the case in many of the former 'independent' homelands. Mangope was removed from his office in April 1994 although this followed conflict between the BDF who had sided with civilians wanting to vote in the South African elections, a demand that Mangope refused. Although none of these homeland structures exists today, issues of community leadership remain contested with different parts of the community recognising different forms of leadership with different political affiliations. This history of leadership struggles continues to impact on crime prevention activities in these four areas as will be discussed in the course of this report. In addition, the severe under-resourcing of homeland areas and the reliance of people living in homelands on 'South Africa' meant that Bophuthatswana has experienced significant underdevelopment and lack of basic municipal service delivery. In keeping with the spirit of the 1998 White Paper on Local Government the incorporation of Temba, Winterveld, Mabopane and GaRankuwa into the city of Tshwane which, prior to 2001 was made up of a combination of predominantly white residential suburbs, small and commercial farmlands and inner city
regions, can be seen as an attempt to ensure more equitable municipal service delivery.

In addition, residential status in the former Bophuthatswana has been highly contested. Winterveld, for example, was one of the few areas where 'black' people could own land under apartheid. Although the Bophuthatswana government declared that only Tswana speaking people could own land in this area, in reality this was not enforced and a diverse group of landowners can currently be found in Winterveld. Since the end of apartheid, nearly one-third of the Winterveld population left the area, mainly for the neighbouring and more urban areas of Mabopane and Soshanguve (Simone, undated). Thus these areas have seen rapidly changing settlement patterns since the end of apartheid alongside contested structures of leadership and very low levels of economic opportunity. Many of these socio-economic conditions have persisted since the 1994 election although the challenges facing these areas are continually shifting.

This section describes some of the current social and economic conditions in the four cross-border areas in order to assess how this may impact on the levels and nature of crime that they face and in order to better understand how equitable safety and security service delivery can take place.

3.2 Cross-border Tshwane: The current situation

It is important to note that although each of these areas was part of Bophuthatswana, they are very diverse and, in particular, they vary according to how rural one can consider them to be. Indeed each of these areas is influenced by their proximity to the city and is therefore more accurately described as mixed rural and urban land use depending, among other factors, on their population density. Graph 1 shows the population for each of these regions.  

Graph 1

Although this graph shows that the highest population levels are in Temba this is largely because it is such a large area. Winterveld and GaRankuwa have very similar population
levels although GaRankuwa is a smaller area with more dense housing patterns surrounded by rural areas whilst Winterveld is predominantly rural. In total, all four areas have a total population of 511,911 which is roughly 26% of the total population of Tshwane.

International research suggests that population characteristics can impact on how crime manifests itself in a community. One such characteristic is the age structure of the population. Graph 2 shows the age structure of the four communities included for this study.

Graph 2

This graph shows that on the whole the population of these areas is very young. In particular, in Temba, the population age peaks between the ages of 4 and 14 years and then drops off sharply. This is likely to impact on the educational levels in the areas as well as the economic well-being of the community as fewer members of the community are of an economically active age. According to the Census 2001 data, in Temba, 43% of the population is under the age of 20 years. This figure is 42% for Winterveld, 38% for Mabopane and 34% for GaRankuwa. These figures indicate the importance of incorporating youth into any crime prevention initiatives.

Graph 3 shows these levels of employment for each of the areas:
What is clear from the above graph is that the bulk of the population in each of the areas included in this study are not employed either because they are not able to find employment or because they are not looking for employment (this includes children, students, the elderly and those who choose not to work. It also includes those who have given up looking for work as Census 2001 only classify those who have been actively looking for work in the last six months as unemployed). In Winterveld in particular, only 32% of the population are employed, which means that these incomes are likely to support large numbers of people. Given the low incomes of people living in these areas (see the following graph) it is unlikely that those who are classified as 'not economically active' are people who choose not to work. Rather this is likely to reflect the youthfulness of the population and the lack of job opportunities in the area.

Graph 4 shows the income levels for each of these areas.
Here we see that almost all of the economically active population earn less than R3200 per month (88% in Temba, 96% in Winterveld, 72% in Mabopane and 76% in GaRankuwa). The slightly higher incomes of those in Mabopane and GaRankuwa may reflect their closer proximity to the city and therefore increased opportunities for secure employment. Overall, however, it is clear that those living in the parts of Tshwane that lie in the North West province are a very poor population.

In particular, such low incomes are likely to reflect historical inequalities in education between former homeland areas and areas considered by the apartheid government to fall within South Africa. This, alongside the relatively young population of these areas, is likely to place additional strain on under-resourced schools.

Graph 5 shows the education levels of the population in each of the four areas included in this study.
This graph shows that a large portion (between 15% and 25%) of the population has no formal education. Winterveld has the highest number of people with no education. In each area, approximately 30% of the population have completed school. Levels of tertiary education are negligible in all four of the areas with the exception of Mabopane where approximately 10% of the population have a Technikon or University level education.

In addition, residential stability has been associated with a lower crime rate in rural areas (as is discussed in more detail below). Census 2001 data indicates that most people in the four areas included in this study had lived in the area for three years or less (67% Temba, 67% Winterveld, 54% Mabopane and 73% GaRankuwa). In particular, GaRankuwa experienced very high levels of residential instability. As the area closest to the city, this may reflect people migrating to the area to look for work in the city, a phenomenon that has its roots in the creation of the homeland system under apartheid.

Residential stability is affected by a number of things. Firstly, the type of housing that one has is important. Those living in informal settlements have little stability and may move frequently because of forced relocation, deteriorating housing etc. In addition, people move according to job opportunities. Key informant interviews for this research suggested that large numbers of people in the four cross-border areas live in the city, where they work, during the week and return to the rural outskirts on weekends or during times of unemployment. This also impacts on the community characteristics of an area, the social relationships that develop, and the patterns of crime that are likely.

Graph 6 shows the kinds of housing that people in the cross-border areas of Tshwane occupy.
This graph shows that, although the majority live in brick houses, significant numbers of people live in informal housing. This is likely to impact on the residential stability of the communities. If one considers the number of people living in informal housing and back yard shacks, in Temba, more than 40% of the population lack adequate housing. Similarly, in Mabopane, almost 30% lack adequate housing.

3.3 Some conclusions

This section has provided a brief overview of some of the challenges to crime prevention in the cross-border areas in Tshwane. What is clear from this analysis is that relative to other parts of Tshwane, these areas have youthful populations who have limited educational and employment opportunities in their area. This is likely to contribute to ongoing migration, a phenomenon already common as a result of the homeland system. Given the residential instability of this population, it would seem that this migration is circular with people constantly moving into and out of the area. As a result of these characteristics, crime prevention will take on a different form to the inner city or wealthier residential parts of the city. In particular, it is likely to require a focus on the economic development (through job creation and skills development) as well as the social development (through building community cohesion and coordinating the range of informal crime prevention activities that emerge).

It is clear that these areas have not recovered from their former disadvantage and that both the economic underdevelopment and the political complexity of the former Bophuthatswana continues to plague these areas.
4. Rural crime prevention: Linking international experience to Tshwane

In many places in the world, rural crime is much lower than crime in the cities. Although crime statistics in South Africa are unavailable, it is likely that this is not the case in the areas identified for this research as they share many of the factors predictive of high crime levels and particularly high levels of violence. In addition, a rural victim survey in 2000 indicated that 59.6% of rural people had been victims of crime during a five-year period (Pelser, Louw and Ntuli, 2000). Specifically, rural areas on the outskirts of cities have often experienced particularly high levels of crime and some of the reasons for this will be discussed in this section.

When analysing why the more rural outskirts of cities have seen rapid increases in crime worldwide, many researchers have suggested that it may be because they are becoming more like cities in terms of their social problems. Certainly, where population density is high, crime also tends to be high (Lee and Ousey, 2001). Where rural areas lie on the outskirts of cities, they tend to experience higher levels of robbery, burglary and motor vehicle theft than rural areas that are not on the urban periphery. Similarly, crime is highest where there are the greatest rewards for crime (such as property of great value), where chances of arrest are low (i.e. where there are large numbers of people who are potentially suspects), where there are few social sanctions or informal systems for monitoring crime, where there is a strong flow of information (for example, people have access to information such as how to pick locks) and where there is a great deal of inequality with the poor being in close contact with the rich (Glaeser and Sacerdote, 1999). Most of these factors have typically been associated with metro cities. Rural areas have traditionally been thought to have a more stable community, fewer suspects (resulting in higher arrest rates), greater economic equality and strong social networks, and informal sanctions against crime (ibid). However, the information in the preceding section indicates that this is not the case in the rural outskirts of Tshwane. These areas have experienced high levels of rural urban migration, unstable and migrant employment patterns and disrupted family and social relationships resulting in increased burdens on single parent households which are usually supported and cared for by women (Mosser, 1999). The creation of apartheid homeland areas meant that people in the four areas being studied here literally 'immigrated' to work – a situation that dramatically altered family structures, childcare practices, social networks and economic opportunities. In addition, these areas have experienced extreme inequality and close contact with wealthy neighbouring suburbs, all factors associated with increased crime rates (Rephann, 1999).

This section reviews how these factors may have affected crime in the cross-border areas based on research from both South Africa and abroad.

4.1 Crime and economic development

In many sectors of South Africa, it is assumed that unemployment leads to increased levels of crime and violence and that creating more jobs is likely to reduce levels of crime, particularly in deprived areas. Indeed, economically deprived areas in South Africa do often experience greater levels of crime, particularly violent crime (Pelser, Louw and Ntuli, 2000). In addition, in some areas, socio-economic disadvantage has also been associated with higher rates of homicide, robbery, burglary and vehicle theft (Rephann, 1999). There are at least two theories as to why this might be the case. The first suggests that poverty results in alienation and frustration which increases levels of offending. The second suggests that poverty means that communities have greater
difficulty in establishing normative consensus, in achieving common goals and therefore in regulating criminal behaviour (Lee and Ousey, 2001).

However, an increase in economic opportunities has not always led to a decrease in crime. Certainly, economic growth in rural outlying areas may increase the economic opportunities of an area but it may well decrease social well-being and, more specifically, increase people's fear of crime. Economic booms have been linked to an increase in mental health problems, an increase in crime, violence and deviance, a decrease in levels of integration within a community, and a decrease in levels of community satisfaction (Hunter, Krannich and Smith, 2002). It has, therefore, been argued that it is economic inequality that results in high crime rates rather than poverty per se. Therefore, economic growth has been helpful in reducing crime where it has increased employment whilst decreasing inequality but negative where it has failed to bring about greater equality. Public assistance and social welfare programmes internationally have been based on an attempt to decrease crime by providing a level of equality in income (Rephann, 1999). Crime has also increased where there has been a boom in trade, in amusement activities such as casinos and bars and where economic development is intense and unsustained.

In addition, the type of jobs created is a strong predictor of whether crime will be reduced or not. For example, an increase in manufacturing industries will have a different effect on the social organisation of a community than an increase in the retail sector. Research suggests that a prevalence of low skilled and poor quality jobs decreases mainstream labour force attachment and social control thereby increasing crime, particularly violent crime (Rephann, 1999). In many development based crime prevention programmes, the manufacturing sector has been seen as the key to crime reduction through increased economic opportunities. However, Lee and Ousey (2001) found that the size of the manufacturing company was what determined whether crime was increased or decreased as a result of more jobs having been created. They suggested that because large firms are very flexible and can afford to relocate if there are signs of economic downturn in an area. They therefore tend to invest less in a surrounding community and have fewer community ties. Small firms, on the other hand do not have such locational flexibility and tend to invest more in the safety of a community as their survival also depends on it. Often such firms play a role in holding the social fabric of a community together through their links with community institutions, community members and political leaders. This research is particularly relevant to the areas formerly part of Bophuthatswana. During apartheid, Bophuthatswana did not charge industries General Sales Tax as an incentive to development in the area. Since 1994, this has fallen away and as a result much of the industrial areas surrounding GaRankuwa have been left vacant. Not only does this mean that job opportunities were dramatically reduced, but the vacant land and buildings also provide potential sites for criminal activities.

In addition to large manufacturing, regions where many people are employed in unskilled work tend to have higher crime rates. This is particularly the case where work is cyclical or seasonal and workers are therefore kept mobile and poor. This is likely to be the case for certain members of each of the four areas in this study who rely on seasonal farm work or unskilled work. Tertiary industries such as retail stores, finance institutions and real estate are also associated with higher crime rates. Because these industries cannot operate from a distance and the goods of these shops are inviting to criminals. In particular, casinos located in rural parts of large cities have been associated with an increase in crime, largely because of the opportunity that increased numbers of
tourists provide (Rephann, 1999). This research suggests that a boom in the tourist industry is only likely to reduce crime where it directly benefits local communities. Where this is the case, there are strong social sanctions against crimes targeting tourist because communities directly feel the economic benefits of this tourism.

Thus the relationship between poverty and crime is complex and unemployment itself does not predict a high level of crime. Rather, where there is an intersection of a number of factors associated with economic development broadly, crime is likely to be affected. Urbanisation is one of these factors. Crime is higher in more densely settled areas, particularly where the population is more heterogeneous and mobile. In these situations people seldom have the opportunity to develop lasting relationships with other community members, which could prevent crime and it becomes difficult to know who is in an area for legitimate reasons. The areas included in this study have a close relationship with the city with many members living in the city for periods of time and others travelling long distances to the city. Based on the research described here, this is likely to result in high levels of crime. This is linked to the nature of the transport system linking rural areas with their surrounding areas.

Where there are more highways, stolen goods become easier to transport. It is therefore of assistance to non-resident criminals. In particular, an increase in the number of highways has been associated with an increase in drug trafficking, auto theft, sale of stolen property, possession of drugs and driving under the influence of alcohol. It may also be associated with an increase in crime because it makes the population more migratory and transient. Thus the Mabopane highway is likely to be a place where crime prevention initiatives can be focused, especially as cross-border areas develop economically, as it links the city with its surrounding rural areas. Finally, the relationship between poverty and crime is likely to be mediated by law enforcement activities in the region. Research indicates that a higher possibility of arrest seems to be a greater deterrent for crime than harsh punishment (Rephann, 1999).

Fear of crime has also been linked to economic development and is often higher in areas where areas appear degraded because people associate it with a weakening of social norms, distrust, social deterioration and feelings of a loss of control. Much bylaw enforcement is an attempt to reduce fear of crime by addressing this sense of social deterioration. Fear is greatest where there are more single parent dwellings, where fewer people own their homes and where there is less integration. This is likely to be a result of the increased poverty that single households live in, and the increasing economic burden placed on single parents, which results in less time for supervision of children and the development of social networks. In spite of this, fear of crime is largely unrelated to individual's actual experiences of victimisation or the actual crime rate. People who live in more rural outskirts of cities tend to have a higher fear of crime than city dwellers (Hunter, et al).

Fear of crime appears to be most related to 'boomtowns' where economic growth has been rapid. This is associated with a fear of strangers as people migrate to the rapidly developing areas for work. This works both ways, as recent migrants to an area are also likely to experience very high levels of fear of crime. In addition, key informant interviews in these areas has shown the extent to which people migrating into an area can be victims of crime because they are not perceived to be there legitimately. In particular, hostility was expressed towards people living in informal settlements and foreigners. Some studies have suggested that this is mediated by how long people have lived in the area with crime being lower in areas where residents have lived in an area
for long periods of time (Hunter et al). Thus rapid migration associated with economic booms can lead to increasing feelings of alienation, mistrust and a breakdown of community relations and programmes to rebuild social networks have been popular crime reduction strategies (Moser, 1999).

4.2 Crime and community networks

The complexity of the relationship between crime and economic disadvantage has led researchers to focus increasing attention on the impact that it has on social and community structures as mentioned above. This research (see for example Lee and Ousey, 2001) has indicated that forms of social organisation and informal social control are most vulnerable when there are multiple forms of socio-economic disadvantage such as poverty, single parent families, low levels of education etc. These researchers found that poverty alone was not significantly related to increased crime but when it was found alongside a high population turnover and a high number of single parents in a community it was. Because the routine activities of such communities are so busy, there are greater opportunities for youth crime as young people are unsupervised whilst adults away from their homes. These absences also reduce opportunities for developing relationships with other community members thereby decreasing social control and community based responses to crime. This begins to offer an explanation as to why crime may differ between two areas with similar levels of poverty (Lee and Ousey, 2001; Moser, 1999).

Recent research has shifted away from a focus on social factors leading to increased crime towards social factors and community characteristics that act as buffers to crime. This research is particularly useful in directing intervention programmes. High levels of social capital, often described as the ‘glue that holds a community together’ include a person's membership of groups and institutions, ability to access authorities such as local government and social networks with others (Castro-Leal, 1999). In particular, an increase in cultural activities such as religious participation has been associated with lower crime rates as has higher levels of family cohesiveness and higher levels of educational attainment (Glaeser and Sacedote, 1999).

Given the young age of the population as described in the preceding section, it is valuable to consider international experiences of youth crime in the rural outskirts of cities. Much youth violence has been explained in terms of social disorganisation theory, which states that crime stems from a disruption of the social fabric because of large population shifts from rural to urban areas.

Community members therefore find it difficult to achieve shared values or to solve joint problems such as crime. This theory was originally developed to explain the disruptive effects that migration and industrial development had on rural communities. It is relevant to the areas considered in this study as they experience high levels of migrant labour as well in-migration from more rural areas because of their proximity to the city. Social disorganisation is thought to be associated with high levels of youth crime because it erodes social control mechanisms. In particular, poverty and continuous migration into and out of an area means that communities don't develop close relationships, which decreases opportunities for informal surveillance of youth. Rural communities may be especially vulnerable when this surveillance breaks down, because they lack other alternatives such as access to well resourced police services or private childcare. Osgood and Chambers (2000) suggest that the factors associated with high levels of youth violence include:
• Residential instability and a high population turnover, which has been associated with increased levels of rape, aggravated assault, weapons violations and assault.
• Heterogeneity of communities, where people have different customs can result in fear and mistrust and has been associated with increases in all violent offences with the exception of homicide and common assault.
• Family disruption (and particularly the creation of migrant labour systems or single parent families) puts a strain on carers' time and resources thereby reducing their ability to supervise youth as well as to develop relationships with other community members that could assist with this. This is likely to be significantly affected by high rates of HIV and increasing numbers of child-headed households in South Africa.
• The proximity of an area to the city also impacts on youth crime. Areas on the outskirts of cities provide more opportunities for young people to be socialised into crime because of the high numbers of criminals operating in cities.

Among this piece of research, family disruption was the most important indicator of youth crime in rural areas. This supports the logic of social disorganisation theory, which suggests that it is not just poverty that leads to an increase in crime but rather the impact that poverty has on social relationships and activities within a community (Osgood and Chambers, 2000).

5. Service delivery and the Tshwane borders

The city of Tshwane is one of the areas that have had to contend with the difficulties of cross-border service delivery. A decision has been made in cabinet that all cross-border areas must be done away with although a time frame for completing this has not been set. The Department of Provincial and Local Government have commissioned a report that will be taken to cabinet to make recommendations on how this issue should be resolved. The problem of boundaries was a recurring one and stakeholders felt very strongly that it affected their ability to deliver crime prevention services.

Three main problems with cross-border service delivery were identified. Firstly, it affected the police's ability to perform their functions. For example, some police stations will have to send half of their statistics to the North West Province and half to Gauteng as their policing area falls across the two provinces. The provinces then return different levels of information to the police station. Therefore some station commissioner complained that they had a lot of information about where and when crimes were taking place for the parts of their station that were in Gauteng but very little for the parts that were in North West. This led to more police activities in the Gauteng parts of the station area and fuelled a perception among communities of unequal service delivery. Also, in some parts of the station area, SAPS believed they could not have joint operations with the Metropolitan police in certain areas (the ones they believed fell outside of the City of Tshwane) and that criminals were aware of which areas these were and used them to avoid roadblocks and other joint operations. In addition, different provinces have different legislation and different priorities for crime prevention. This may result in different levels and types of service delivery.

This has led to a secondary problem which is the perception of differential service delivery – sometimes within a community that lay partly within Tshwane and partly outside of it as well as between communities in the North West and those in Gauteng. This was most pronounced in Mabopane. Repeatedly, informants emphasised that Mabopane was only separated from Soshanguve by a bridge. However, Soshanguve
falls within Gauteng and has always been part of the Greater Pretoria Metropolitan Region. As a result, Mabopane has little lighting, poorer quality roads and very few development projects operating. In contrast Soshanguve has donor funded violence reduction and youth development projects in operation and attempts at Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design have been made. This perception of unequal service delivery also extends to services that do not relate as directly to safety and security such as electricity and water provision as well as refuse removal.

Finally, a third problem relating to cross-border service delivery is that few people know where the boundaries actually are. For example in interviewing stakeholders for this research, SAPS indicated that Hebron was not part of Tshwane, however, Tshwane Metropolitan Police Service argued that it was. Among other stakeholders there was disagreement on whether Klipgat was part of the metro or not. Some communities were not aware that they were part of Tshwane when they were interviewed.

Similarly, members at the GaRankuwa court felt that the signs indicating where Gauteng ended and North West began in GaRankuwa were in the wrong place. The signs suggest that GaRankuwa falls almost equally within North West and Gauteng, however, maps suggest that the bulk of GaRankuwa falls within the North West. This has implications for the allocation of provincial resources. For example, GaRankuwa hospital works out which patients come from the North West and which come from Gauteng and then charges each province accordingly. The main reason for the confusion about boundaries is that some of the boundaries were farm boundaries and many of these farms have since been divided or are no longer there. The future re-alignment of boundaries will use boundaries such as rivers or roads.

Discussions with stakeholders have indicated that decisions about how to avoid cross-border service delivery are influenced by politics, as some provinces want to keep certain areas and lose others in order to maximise support for particular political parties within the city and the province. It is therefore unlikely that these decisions will be taken before the elections in 2004. The influence of politics means that issues of creating redress in service delivery are likely to be lost in spite of it being central to the intention of the White Paper on Local Government.

However, the most likely scenario is that the four areas included in this study, as well as two others (Hebron and Erasmus) will become part of Gauteng. Indeed the Demarcation Board is working with other role players such as SAPS to ensure their boundaries do not create cross-border service delivery based on this assumption. This is, however, complex. The reason for not including these areas initially in the city of Tshwane is that they still have strong tribal authorities that are involved in the management of the community. Gauteng does not, however, have a house of traditional leaders to oversee the activities of the tribal authority. This will be discussed in more detail below. It is therefore already a challenge to Gauteng and it is likely that a new structure such as the house of traditional leaders will need to be created. However, currently, tribal and community authorities do not have strong working relationships with the City and there is a risk that these decisions are made without their proper consultation.

This lack of consultation with community leaders is particularly concerning given the large amounts of consultation that has taken place regarding the realignment of boundaries with other stakeholders such as the SAPS, the TMPS and community members. The situation for SAPS is even more complex as not only are they providing services across provincial borders but also across municipal borders. In other words
some of their communities fall partly within Tshwane and partly within Madibeng, the
neighbouring municipality, as well as being within both Gauteng and the North West.
The realignment of boundaries therefore will involve handing some communities over
to other police station areas and gaining new areas – a process that will require strong
community consultation, particularly among communities that already feel that the
services they receive are not as good as those of neighbouring communities. Where it is
unavoidable, SAPS will continue to work across boundaries although this will be
avoided if at all possible.

These problems relating to boundaries frame many of the issues that will be raised in
the sections below and so will be returned to frequently.

6. Policing

Perhaps the most important issue to note is that in all the cross-border areas, the police
are one of few role players in crime reduction. In some areas they were the only people
providing safety services making them a key point of contact for the community.

6.1 Crime in the cross-border areas

When asked to describe the crimes most common in their areas, both the metropolitan
police and the SAPS in all the areas selected identified two different types of crimes that
were pervasive. Firstly, it was clear that serious violence was the main problem in these
areas. This crime was often gendered and high levels of domestic violence and rape
were identified by all police officers interviewed. In addition, assault with intent to do
grievous bodily harm and armed robbery were also identified in every case. This is in
keeping with the international literature, which suggests that deprived economic
conditions are often associated with high levels of violent crime. However, at another
level, it was felt that basic management and upgrading of the area was also a central
priority. In some cases, the two were considered to be related. For example, poor
housing was blamed for high rates of rape and burglary:

The types of house we stay in. Most of them are zincs and planks (shacks).
For you to break in is easy, you just remove the zinc and get in. There are no
proper structures like bricks with cement and iron. Also most of the
factories in the Babelegi industrial area … so called former Bophuthatswana
industrial areas, they are left abandoned. You may find people start to break
in to steal copper cables.

When asked to describe their crime prevention activities, both the metro police and the
SAPS felt that through the course of their law enforcement duties crime was prevented.
Indeed the most common forms of crime prevention included enforcing law that
regulated facilitators of violence such as the Liquor Act or through search and seizure
procedures and roadblocks. Many of the police (MPS and SAPS) also conducted
education with communities. This was done mostly through churches and schools and
involved police explaining what the audience should or shouldn't be doing.

For example, in relation to the prevention of domestic violence, one commissioner
stated:

We invite the women of the area and give them a workshop in awareness
and invite some people from the area office who specialise in that. And we
also give lectures at the school to make children aware. You know most of
the rapes that happen here happen after eight or nine at night when the
parents ask the children to quickly go to the shop and buy something

Generally, crimes such as domestic violence and rape were particularly difficult for the
police to deal with. For metropolitan police, this is a relatively new kind of work and
their handling of it was at times inconsistent. For example one metropolitan police
officer stated that:

Normally we go out to that place and we try to diffuse the situation if
possible. But according to the [Domestic Violence] Act if it's not possible
we take the woman away to a safe place … we normally take her to an uncle
or an aunt. We tell them you can go to the police station, you can get a
restraining order but they don't want that.

Similarly, both the courts and the SAPS complained that people misused the Domestic
Violence Act to settle differences that were not serious or that they laid a charge and
then withdrew the case, which inflated the police statistics. They felt that this meant that
a domestic violence charge was not warranted in spite of the crime still having taken
place. One woman interviewed at the ODI Community Law Clinic described how when
she had tried to lay a charge against her partner, the police officer had tried to convince
her that her case was not really domestic violence. These and other problems with the
handling of domestic violence will be discussed in more detail in forthcoming CSVR
report on domestic violence in Tshwane. However, these brief examples indicate that
there is a great deal of work that needs to be done with policing services to ensure that
women in these areas have access to laws that protect them and to prevent this kind of
poor practice among police.

Some station commissioners had gone further in their crime prevention activities and
had made attempts to build community relationships for example by organising sports
teams and a competition between them. This is a programme with the potential to
improve community relations and provide supervision for young people. However this
was only found in one case and most police (both SAPS and TMPS) limited their crime
prevention to education as described above.

In addition, Community Police Forums varied in their levels of activity and in several
cases we were able to interview both the station commander and the CPF chair. As with
the SAPS, the crime prevention initiatives described by CPFs included education of the
community and the maintenance of public spaces to reduce crime.
6.2 Metropolitan policing

The role of municipal police varied in each of the four areas in this study. The metropolitan police areas are much larger than the SAPS areas and inevitably cover large areas that have always been part of the Greater Pretoria Metropolitan Area as well as new cross-border areas. In each region, service delivery was seen to be a problem in the cross-border area. SAPS, courts and community organisations felt that the metropolitan police were not operating in their areas and mostly patrolled the main roads, which were far from the rural parts of the metro. In extreme cases, some people did not believe that there were metropolitan police in their area. However, the most common perception was that the Tshwane Metropolitan police only patrolled main roads. As one SAPS member stated:

They are doing a good job … but they are neglecting the Mabopane areas. That's the community's perception. A lot of manpower and a lot of resources are being taken away to Soshanguve and Soshanguve is just a bridge away from us. People are raising these things because they are seeing what they're doing in Soshanguve. … I think basically they're stationed there and so they are giving first preference to that area … but the name Tshwane means "we are the same." From our point of view we are not being treated equally. The answer I got when I engaged them was "lack of manpower". It should not be a lack of manpower on our side only. There is more manpower when they work in Soshanguve but there is a lack of manpower when it comes to our side.

In addition, one of the traditional leaders felt that:
The metro police don't even bother coming in the village, they just pass the village by from the main road.

Indeed, the metropolitan police did acknowledge, in some areas, that extending service delivery to these areas was a difficulty. One of the main barriers identified was a lack of understanding of and knowledge about the communities they were working with. Some of the regions had little contact with members of the community, community organisations and community leaders.

Previously, no bylaws existed for the cross-border areas. All bylaws therefore need to be re-written in order to apply to all areas of the metro, a process which is already underway. This process will need to take into account the different needs of the cross-border parts of the metro. Not only is the development of bylaws for these areas a welcome step forward from the perspective of both the SAPS and the MPS, but the nature of the bylaws that will be useful in these areas clearly differs from those of the more urban areas. Central to these areas is the ability of the police to manage the combination of high density living in some areas (particularly Mabopane and GaRankuwa), which exists alongside rural livelihoods. The most commonly cited transgressions that the SAPS would like the Metropolitan Police to deal with are the traffic offences such as unlicensed drivers and taxis, the enforcement of bylaws relating to keeping of livestock and the enforcement of liquor bylaws. Most saw this as having the potential to address the more serious crimes identified such as serious, common and sexual assaults (through the enforcement of liquor bylaws) as well as armed robberies (through police surveillance of vehicles on the roads).

In addition to bylaw enforcement, many stakeholders felt that basic municipal services, extended to the cross-border areas, would improve safety. In particular, the maintenance of open spaces (by cutting grass) and the provision of street lighting and street names would improve safety in the area. Both SAPS and TMPS felt that street names and proper maps were a priority if they were to improve their services. As one SAPS member stated:

> We need mapping on the North West side and the new parts of Soshanguve. There are no street names and it makes it difficult to locate a problem … . They send you to block X and there is no street name. You know the main road is called Hebron Road … but then there is nothing.

For the TMPS, the main partner that they worked with was the SAPS. There were difficulties in their interactions and often a lack of communication between SAPS and the MPS was a result of a lack of equipment. However, for the SAPS stations that were furthest from the city, only the very minimum cooperation had been accomplished. At times this interaction was also erratic. As one interviewee stated:

> Yes, the head of Region X crime prevention visited our morning crime prevention meetings. But it happened for maybe two or three weeks and he didn't come again. But like I told you, I have an invitation from the Tshwane metro police for the 28th August … . We would like to improve the relationship between the metro police and the SAPS in this region, therefore we invite the regional head to attend the meeting.

The most common interactions between SAPS and Metropolitan police were roadblocks and occasionally assistance with special events management. However, the lack of
capacity in these regions means that even this interaction is limited. In spite of this, both parties expressed a willingness to cooperate and the SAPS were generally very positive about the work of the TMPS in spite of their lack of capacity.

The Tshwane crime prevention strategy is very clear on issues of policing. It emphasises preventing crime through visible policing, zero tolerance and crackdowns. Although each of these will be important in the cross-border areas, this approach requires a great deal of personnel and resources, which is not available in these areas. It is perhaps this lack of capacity that has resulted in the metro police relying predominantly on reactive policing in these areas. This is not altogether problematic, as rural policing will clearly need to differ from policing in the urban areas. In particular the idea of visible patrol is unlikely to be successful in sparsely populated areas. It may, therefore, be necessary to adapt existing crime prevention strategies to include the needs of the more rural, cross-border areas.

In spite of this, some of the other stakeholders interviewed indicated that there were serious problems with the police. In relation to the metro police, one of the criticisms was that when they first formed they had assisted SAPS and communities by, for example, responding quickly or by delivering protection orders in cases of domestic violence. However, with time, this response had slowed and some community-based organisations complained that when they called the metro police they didn't have vehicles to respond. The perception that metropolitan policing had declined is particularly concerning given the high expectations that stakeholders had about belonging to the metro and the creation of these new services.

7. Community leadership

7.2 The structure of community leadership

The history of the former homeland areas has made issues of community leadership extremely complex in the four cross-border areas in Tshwane. In some areas, tribal authorities continue to exist and are a key stakeholder when accessing communities. In others, these structures have completely fallen away. Similarly, as with all community structures, their role and structure has shifted with the political changes in the country and changing community needs.

Some community leaderships are still based on tribal allegiances, for example the tribal authority in Hebron represents the Bakgatla baMakawu tribe. Although some members of the community are from other tribes, they are expected to live according to the customs of the Bakgatla baMakawu tribe. In this case, the chief appoints headmen, all of whom are male, who sit on the tribal council. In this instance, issues of migration into the area, especially squatters and foreigners, was cited as a major source of conflict. It is likely that this is, at least in part, to be due to the potential of new arrivals not recognising the tribal authority. Similarly, the Mabhoko village is entirely Ndebele and the traditional leadership is also, therefore, based on tribal allegiances. The traditional leadership structure consists of the chief who has two assistants. Under them is a youth council made up of 10 people which sees to all the issues that the communities face with the chief playing an oversight role.

In contrast to this approach, other traditional leaders have recognised that their areas are becoming increasingly diverse and have adapted traditional structures accordingly. This is most notable in Winterveld and Temba. In these cases, a community authority has
been developed whereby some members of the traditional council are elected for a five year term by the community and others are appointed by the chief or the president of the community authority. Each of the ethnic groups living in the area is represented on the council. Women are also elected onto the council in these two areas.

This latter approach is perhaps closest to the structure identified in the Traditional Leadership and Governance Framework Bill (2003). The bill recommends a system whereby a traditional council must be established by the community some of whom are appointed by the traditional community leaders and at least 25% of which are elected by the community. It also states that a quota should be set whereby at least 30% of the council are women. If the new Bill is passed without major revision, then it will require some significant changes in the structure and functioning of some of the traditional communities in the cross-border areas of Tshwane.

7.2 Functions of traditional leadership

In each of these areas where community authorities exist, traditional or customary courts are in operation. The range of cases seen in these customary courts varies as does the kinds of sentencing they impose. Even under the Black Administration Act of 1929, which remains the legislation governing the functioning of traditional leaders today, traditional councils are not supposed to be hearing cases of murder, arson, robbery, homicide, treason and rape. In reality, Delius (1996) notes that even under British colonial rule, this was seldom enforced and traditional councils have tended to determine for themselves the cases that they hear. The most common issues dealt with among the traditional leaders interviewed for this research were disputes over land and conflicts between community members (such as assault). Only one of the courts did state that they dealt with rape although all the courts said that they dealt with domestic violence in one form or another. In one case (the Winterveld community authority), no punishment is handed down and the purpose of the court is to mediate between parties. In this case courts deal only with civil cases. In reality the perceived division between civil and criminal cases is often a rather blurred boundary. For example, of the five tribal authorities, three of them stated that one of the most common complaints that they receive are for domestic violence. All stated that when the case is severe, they pass it on to the police but that in more minor disputes they mediate between the parties. The way in which domestic violence is defined by community leaders and which cases are forwarded to police and which are not is a challenge mentioned in the South African Law Commission report (2003) on the Traditional courts and the Judicial Function of Traditional Leaders. Also, the report mentions the need to make clear the distinction between rape and seduction (the latter being defined and dealt with in the customary courts and the former in the magistrate's courts). In addition, customary courts often hear cases related to paternity where a man who has a child out of wedlock may have to compensate the family of the pregnant woman. In these cases there is a need to ensure that such a settlement does not imply that the woman is not entitled to maintenance. Thus, one of the challenges facing the formalisation of the customary courts is to ensure that they work in collaboration with the local magistrate's court and that there is greater uniformity between them in the cases they hear and punishments they hand down.

The courts follow a system of holding Lekgotla. The community leader chairs the meeting and determines the sentence or mediates between the parties. Where a sentence is passed, it often involves working for the chief or the person who has been wronged. These Lekgotla's are generally open to members of the community who can attend and contribute to the proceedings. It is this emphasis on popular participation that has been
identified a one of the primary strengths of the customary courts. Also, the emphasis on restorative justice and community participation is one of the central social crime prevention tenants of the Tshwane Crime Prevention Strategy. This provides an already existing system of community mobilisation and victim empowerment that can be facilitated and supported by the local authority. Other reasons for their popularity within communities are that they are free, are easily accessible and the system of law used is uncomplicated. They are also held in the local language which makes more people willing to participate in court proceedings.

In spite of these advantages, there have been challenges to the system of customary courts. One of the primary criticisms of the customary court procedure is that it is discriminatory towards women. Only two of the community authorities had women on the traditional council. These two structures showed a commitment to transforming community leadership to better serve the interests of women. However, they did resist some changes, for example, allowing women into the boys' customary schools and vice versa. Some customary courts do not allow women to bring a case to the court unless represented by a male relative or her husband. In one community men and women attend separate Lekgotla's. This is likely to be problematic because in this case one of the primary problems that the community were dealing with was domestic violence and only the men were making decisions regarding what should be done about domestic violence. The Traditional Leadership and Governance Bill is very clear about reducing sexism in customary courts through representation of women on the traditional council and through allowing people to choose between taking their case to the magistrates court instead of the customary court. However, ensuring that these courts address women's needs in practice, especially in light of the prevalence of domestic violence, will be an ongoing challenge.

In addition, the community leaders in some areas felt that only the older people in the community still respected the Lekgotla but that the younger generations tended not to. Often this was because the youth were thought to follow the councillors and not the community leaders - a dilemma which will be considered in more detail below. Thus a further challenge to systems of traditional leadership is to get youth invested in the community authority. In some communities, youth projects had been developed and supported by community authorities, which tended to improve the relationships with the youth. Working together with traditional leaders and councillors, however, remains one of the central challenges for ensuring that youth are integrated into crime prevention efforts in the cross-border areas.

One of the most interesting ways in which traditional leaders have been integrated into local government functions is in Uganda where customary courts deal with by-law enforcement and transgressions of bylaws (South African Law Commission, 2003). The local authority in Tshwane could, at least, include traditional leaders in the process of re-writing the bylaws and in identifying key bylaws that need to be prioritised in the cross-border areas. Indeed this potential has been recognised in the Bill as will be discussed below.

In addition, community leaders in these cross-border areas play roles such as administering grants such as the child maintenance grant and the old age pensions. In some cases, community leaders felt that this was their only remaining function and that they had many more skills that could be used in crime prevention projects. On the whole, community leaders expressed a great deal of dissatisfaction with the limited role that they were playing in the metro and in crime prevention more specifically.
7.3 Relationships with other stakeholders

This report has already alluded to the ways in which local authorities will need to work with traditional leaders. In this section, we will consider some of the existing relationships between traditional leaders and other crime prevention stakeholders and highlight gaps in this collaboration. The Traditional Leadership and Governance Framework Bill identifies a very specific relationship between local authorities and traditional leaders. It states that a traditional council has the following functions among others:

- Facilitating the involvement of the traditional community in the development or amendment of the integrated development plan of a municipality in whose area that community resides;
- Supporting municipalities in identification of community needs;
- Recommending appropriate interventions to government that will contribute to development and service delivery within the area of jurisdiction of the traditional council;
- Participating in the programmes of municipalities and of the provincial and national spheres of government.

In addition it emphasises the role of provincial government in promoting good collaboration between local authorities and traditional leaders. More specifically, it states that the district house of traditional leaders (which will have to be established in accordance with the Act when it is passed) will advise the metropolitan municipality on the development of bylaws that impact on the traditional community.

The importance of mutual recognition and respect between the Municipalities and the traditional leaders was recognised in the South Africa Law Commission report on Traditional Courts and the Judicial Function of Traditional Leaders (2003) which states that "if an attempt is made to abolish chiefs courts, traditional leaders would withdraw their full cooperation in local government which would probably cause disruption (p. 9). Indeed in the past, the Congress of Traditional Leaders in South Africa (Contralesa) has stated that members should not serve in the local municipality until negotiations over the role of traditional leaders had been clarified and threatened to discipline members that did (Zoutnet, 2001). Thus, a failure to recognise the role of traditional leaders, especially in light of the ways in which the Bill emphasises mutual collaboration between them and local government is likely to have an extremely detrimental effect on crime prevention service delivery in traditional communities. To some extent this has already happened in the cross-border areas of Tshwane.

It is therefore, useful to consider some of the barriers and challenges to the development of this kind of collaborative relationship in the City of Tshwane. A primary concern for traditional authorities was their relationship with local authorities especially the councillors who they felt did not recognise their authority. As one community leader stated:

The story about councillors in our area is very long. When the local government system started in 1995, they wanted to close this office down. They said the chiefs were no longer necessary. We had to take the matter to the Supreme Court in Mmabatho and we also contacted Mr Mufamadi [the minister for Local and Provincial Government] concerning the matter. That issue damaged the relations between the councillors and us.
The poor relationships between councillors and community leaders were blamed, at least in part, for poor service delivery in the cross-border areas. As one respondent stated:

There is no service delivery. But I know what is the problem. There is conflict between the councillors and us. You can't deliver when you can't communicate with the owner of the land . . . . [The councillors] promised the people houses . . . but how long should they keep telling lies to the people. Councillors have no room to deliver in X area. They have to put their offices here.

Again this quote shows the perception that the municipality are far removed from the cross-border areas and that they do not deliver in these areas. This suggests that municipal offices in the cross-border areas would be a minimum first requirement to gain increasing community support. As one respondent said:

I don't know how metro police operate. They are working on the other side [of the metro] but not in our area.

There were also many other examples where community authorities were simply not consulted on decisions to be taken in the metro. Although, in the absence of the Traditional Leadership and Governance Framework Bill being finalised it is unclear what level of consultation the City of Tshwane are required to initiate with community leaders, the perceived failure to consult meant that service delivery was compromised and there was limited support for municipal interventions and programmes. For example, the community leaders were not aware of the current discussions taking place regarding changing the provincial or metropolitan boundaries. As one community leader stated:

I overheard the [SAPS] captain talking about it last week. They're doing these things in their offices. They're going to cut Winterveld here and give it to Klipgat and then the people here in Makaunyane must report their cases to Hammanskraal . . . very far from here. They don't consult. They just draw a map in their office. That's very dangerous when you don't consult people. There will be conflicts.

The most long-standing and perhaps the most bitter conflict between the community leaders and the local government structures was over land. Tribal authorities traditionally have control over land in their area and there are procedures that need to be followed for a person to apply for land in an area. One tribal authority stated that:

We don't have any relationship with the councillors. The squatters support the ANC and disrespect the chiefs. The ward councillors are members of the ANC. The councillors promise to build houses for the people and to provide water and electricity. So the duties of the chiefs are now falling off because the people now go to them for land. The councillors are not consulting us. They do as they please and forget that we control the land. The most important thing is that the land belongs to us. We are fighting with the squatters and they [the councillors] say they will not remove their shacks from the land. We send the herdsmen to talk to [the squatters] and they say they have paid money for the land to the ward councillor.
The chiefs therefore felt extremely threatened by the residents of informal settlements and recent migrants into the area as well as the relationship that they perceived these groups to have with the ward councillors. This is an extremely complex and difficult conflict. On the one hand, it continues to reflect apartheid-based rifts between the ANC and the leadership of the 'independent' homelands. In an ANC lead city like Tshwane, the community leaders feel increasingly marginalized. On the other hand, the resistance that community leaders have to migration into their areas (they complained about both immigrants and squatters) reflects their concern about keeping their power base. Allegations of corruption by councillors and other stakeholders such as the SAPS were common. This conflict over land is especially difficult for local government as they have a key role to play in providing housing and upgrading informal settlements. The community leaders could provide a great deal of resistance to this. As one community leader stated:

We do not have a good relationship with the police. We opened the case of trespassing regarding illegal squatting and police have done nothing to help us with the matter. The docket was opened and we have a case number but nothing has come out of that case. The person who is giving them permission to squat without our permission is a ward councillor X. He charged them R300 or R200 and promised them water and electricity in the area. He has not delivered on those promises.”

This kind of scenario puts both councillors and SAPS in a difficult position as the removal of squatters has to follow the specifications of the Prevention of Illegal Eviction and Occupation of Land Act which states that if people have resided illegally on land for more than six months, then they cannot be removed unless alternative land is made available. As discussed in section 2 and 3, stable housing is one factor in facilitating effective crime prevention in peri-urban and rural areas and the upgrading of informal settlements is therefore an important initiative. However, there is likely to be resistance from community authorities and some form of mediation may be required. It is clear that land is a central issue in the cross-border areas and both community leaders and councillors, to win community support, often exploit it. These community divisions have already hampered crime prevention in the area and may need to be addressed before further projects are implemented.

Although some traditional leaders reported equally poor relationships with members of the SAPS, many indicated that they were working in collaboration with them. In particular, they worked with the CPFs and in two cases traditional authorities had representation on the CPF. They also worked with the SAPS by providing them with information needed for investigating crime and by referring cases to them. However, there were cases where this relationship was problematic. For example, in one area, the traditional leaders stated that the police would not accept a case unless the person reporting it had a letter from the chief. This is likely to be problematic in several cases, for example domestic violence, where a person may want to choose not to use the traditional authority structures. In spite of these kinds of problems, the levels of engagement between CPFs and traditional leaders may mean that this is a forum where local authorities can begin to build relationships with traditional leaders and draw them into the City's crime prevention activities.
8. Community based and non-profit projects

The purpose of this section is to give a brief overview of the types of community or NGO initiated activities in the cross-border areas so that these can be supported and supplemented by local authorities where appropriate. It does not give a complete description of all community based crime prevention in the area. Most community activities in this area are small, unfunded and are run by the community without support from government or NGOs. This report tries to emphasise these as it highlights the level of community mobilisation and emphasises the kinds of projects that local government could support easily and inexpensively. The projects identified can roughly be classified in terms of their activities as follows:

8.1 Economic empowerment

Almost all stakeholders saw economic development as the key to crime reduction in the cross-border areas. In spite of this there were relatively few programmes that aimed to improve economic conditions and those that did exist were often very informal. For example, the community authority in Winterveld has developed a programme for young women. This project is for school leavers where they learn skills such as chicken breeding, baking and gardening and create small businesses to sell their products. The community authority donated the land for these activities. In Mabopane and Temba these kinds of initiatives also exist although often informally among small groups of people rather than with the support of community or local government authorities. In addition, some members of the community had negotiated with Eskom to use land owned by them to grow vegetables (see picture below). These are mainly for private consumption but where they can they also sell some of what they grow. Discussions
with the leader of the Winterveld group indicated that their main needs were additional training and information about other youth empowerment projects – a service than may well be facilitated or provided by local authorities.

Similarly, community members requested information about how to prevent pests and which crops to plant during which seasons. Thus the needs of these communities were often inexpensive and simple.

Similarly, the Ndebele village is an attempt to develop tourism in these areas using the beadwork skills and cultural heritage of the community of the Mabhoko village. Initially sponsored by the North West Tourism Board this project has been fairly well capacitated. However, the community lack based services which would encourage tourists to visit such as tarred roads, lighting and signs pointing out where the village is.

8.2 Legal assistance

Some projects offer assistance with the police and court procedure as one of several activities they undertake (see for example WACA below). The only project that offers dedicated legal assistance as its core function is the Odi Community Law Clinic. This clinic is donor funded and only operates in the GaRankuwa community. The clinic deals with a range of cases but many of these are cases of domestic violence. The clinic assists people with the court process and provides para-legal advice. They work in conjunction with the Restorative Justice Initiative, which is an approach to dealing with crime that emphasises the promotion of reconciliation and restitution rather than punitive punishment. One of the flagship projects of the Restorative Justice Initiative is the Victim Offender Conferencing project. This project is entirely donor funded and
8.3 Trauma support and community reconciliation

Women against Community Abuse (WACA) offer assistance to women who experience domestic violence as well as general crime and violence. The project is based in GaRankuwa and emphasises providing services to rural communities. WACA offers counselling for people who have experienced violence, shelters for women who experience domestic violence, mediation services and creates peer groups for youth in schools. The shelter can only accommodate three people at a time and the organisation is severely under-resourced (see Vetten and Khan, 2002).

In addition, most police stations had trauma rooms in the station. However, for those that did not, Legae private clinic, which serves the GaRankuwa and Mabopane region has a trauma centre. This centre has a member of the SAPS as well as a trained counsellor present 24 hours a day which compensates for the fact that the clinic next to the SAPS station only has been closed.

The Soshanguve Peace and Development Project is an NGO project which currently only operates in Soshanguve, however, the local government in Tshwane are about to roll this project out to Mabopane. This project is funded by the German government and offers a combination of neighbourhood patrols, training on conflict mediation as well as teaching participants leadership skills, radio control and radio usage, first aid and related skills. The trained members then do community patrols, mediation where there is conflict in the community, as well as doing education with other youth on the consequences of crime. After a year of community service, members of the project are offered additional training such as career guidance and counselling that is intended to assist them to gain employment. The project mostly recruits youth and works closely with the local council. This project is evidence of the willingness of the community to participate in crime prevention and their hunger to increase their opportunities.

8.4 Some initial conclusions

This brief description of some of the key community based projects in this area highlights several points:

- Most projects exist within GaRankuwa and Mabopane. As described in earlier sections, Temba and Winterveld are the furthest from the city, have the lowest levels of unemployment and education and have the poorest municipal service delivery. This therefore suggests that these areas should be prioritised when developing crime prevention projects.
- Many attempts have been made by communities to reduce crime in their areas and the willingness to work with local government is very high. There was, however, little relationship between communities and local authorities in these
areas.

• The requests that communities have for Local Government assistance are relatively small and inexpensive. Some relate to basic service delivery such as access to water to assist in farming development projects and street lights.

• The priority concerns for communities in relation to crime prevention are poverty and unemployment and disruption of social and family relations as a result of unfavourable working conditions and family conflict. It is therefore important for local authorities to prioritise a development-based approach to crime prevention as they continue to roll out municipal police services.

9. Key gaps/sites for intervention

9.1 Rural crime prevention planning

The Tshwane crime prevention strategy does provide a comprehensive guide to crime prevention that covers Crime Prevention through Environmental Design (CPTED), policing and social crime prevention. Much of this can be used effectively in rural areas but there are some characteristics that make rural Tshwane unique that need to be taken into account. For example, the emphasis on visible policing will need to be reconsidered, particularly for the parts of the cross border areas that are sparsely populated and vast, and the focus may need to be on other forms of crime prevention. Similarly, the inclusion of community leaders and existing community based projects should guide the crime prevention projects in order to ensure that communities support any projects by the local authority. In addition, the strategy does not give detail on what the social crime prevention projects should be or which of the key areas identified should be prioritised in different parts of the city. This report is intended to guide these decisions.

In addition, one of the primary findings of this report was the local government crime prevention structures were not always aware of the structure, priorities and activities of the communities. Ongoing community meetings and consultations will need to be the basis for any crime prevention projects developed in the cross-border areas, particularly given the history of poor service delivery and political rivalry in these areas.

9.2. Youth crime and family support

Based on the literature review above and the analysis of social and economic conditions in this report, one of the primary sites of intervention would be with youth. The main problems that youth in this area are likely to face are low levels of educational attainment (often because of poverty), unemployment and disrupted family systems. Youth projects that address unemployment have already been initiated by the communities and may simply need support from local government as is described below. Because of the importance of economic factors in crime in these areas, access to social grants should be a key priority, particularly child support grants. Information about how to access these grants and assistance for those who qualify may be another small but effective intervention that can be made at local government level.

The one area that had not been addressed in any of the projects is that of family support. Given the disrupted family structures described in the early sections of this report this would be an important intervention. One of the most successful attempts to support families in raising young people has been the provision of after-school care. These programmes are often based in buildings owned by local government and offer
assistance with homework, recreational activities and, at times, additional training on
topics such as mediation or violence reduction. These projects are intended to provide
community support for child and youth care and are often run by volunteers. Other
youth crime prevention projects include conflict resolution and mediation training for
youth, child care support for young people who are primary caregivers to younger
children but would like to continue to attend school and diversion programmes to help
young people avoid the formal criminal justice system when they have committed
minor offences. There is also a potential role for traditional leaders in youth diversion
and, to some extent, it is a role they have already been playing through the customary
courts. This may be particularly important because it may mean that young people can
serve community sentences in their local area as transport to the location where the
sentence is to be served has been a problem in the implementation of diversion projects
in other rural communities. The Child Justice Bill allows for different levels of
diversion from a police warning to community service and Tshwane Metropolitan
Police may be involved all levels of diversion when the Bill becomes an Act. In
addition, community sentencing could include assisting with local government service
delivery such as the maintenance of parks and open spaces.

9.3 Economic empowerment

Economic empowerment projects are particularly poorly supported in these areas. This
is ironic given the extent to which poverty was a key concern of both government and
community stakeholders interviewed. In addition, given the lack of job opportunities in
these areas, local government could play a key role in supporting small enterprises.
Support for economic empowerment programmes could include training on small
business management, provision of trading stalls or markets as well as secure places for
storing goods. The promotion of small enterprises and job creation is identified as a key
aspect of social crime prevention in the Tshwane crime prevention strategy and the
support of these programmes therefore is within the mandate of the local authority.

9.4 Community knowledge and solidarity

Existing conflicts between community leaders and local government structures act as a
barrier to effective crime prevention. The local government may, therefore want to
develop discussions with community leaders on their role in the running of the
community and in crime prevention specifically. Particular efforts should be made to
ensure that they are incorporated into CPFs and other structures where this has not
already happened. In particular, the metropolitan police had a very limited engagement
with traditional leaders and initiating meetings with them to clarify the roles and
responsibilities of both parties may be an important first step in building community
relationships.

However, there are other initiatives that have been developed to ensure coordination
between role-players which the City of Tshwane may want to be part of. For example,
UMAC, an independent NGO, have initiated discussions with Gauteng to develop
Community Safety Forums in the province. These forums bring all stakeholders
together to coordinate crime prevention efforts. This is a model that has been successful
in the Western Cape and the Eastern Cape and is being replicated nationally
(Bezuidenhout, 2003). Although the Tshwane Crime Prevention Forum meets regularly,
the fact that the meeting takes place in the inner city makes it inaccessible to most local
stakeholders in the cross-border areas.
In addition to this, several projects have attempted to build community solidarity within communities in other contexts. In South America, for example, youth clubs that organise cultural, sporting and other entertaining events have been supported by local governments. They hold regular community days where people have an opportunity to develop relationships with members of the community and to support youth projects. These kinds of projects aim to ensure that members of a community know one another and develop good relationships that can help to prevent crime, for example, by watching each other's houses or monitoring other people's children.

9.5 CPTED

Many stakeholders highlighted CPTED as key to crime prevention. In particular they emphasised the need for lighting in the area and the maintenance of the many large open spaces in the more rural areas. In addition, abandoned buildings were identified as providing opportunities for crime. CPTED is relatively simple for the local authority to implement and can be immediately implemented in order to address perceptions that local authorities are not providing services on an equal basis. By beginning with this kind of service provision, local authorities can begin to develop the kinds of community relationships that would be required for the social crime prevention initiatives describe in this report. This fits within the Tshwane crime prevention strategy, which emphasises the identification of hotspots and the ways in which CPTED principles can be used to reduce crime in those areas.

Similarly, negotiations with communities in the cross-border areas about the process of developing bylaws as well as the kinds of bylaws that need to be prioritised in the cross-border areas could be an important first step toward a broader crime prevention approach.

9.6 Role-out and replication

The above sections indicate that communities are highly mobilised and are engaging in crime prevention activities both with and without the assistance of local government. The role of the local authority could, therefore, be to support existing initiatives though both funding, training and replication of projects. The strength of these projects that communities have implemented is that they are based on localised understanding of crime and its causes although they are often very isolated in their work (particularly the smaller projects) and operate in a small and sometimes ad hoc way. The role of local government could be to facilitate learning across these projects and to provide opportunities for other communities to learn from those who have designed their own crime prevention projects.
These photographs show the same road as it runs through Soshanguve, Mabopane and then Winterveld. It shows how basic services such as road signs, electricity, road quality, street markings etc deteriorate as one travels further away from the city.
Notes:

1 Appendix 1 shows a map of the City of Tshwane.

2 Some of these NGOs will be interviewed in the forthcoming CSVR report on gender based violence. Our purpose for this report was not to get in-depth information on the activities of NGOs but to identify their main activities and the gaps in service delivery.

3 These population figures are taken from Census 2001 data. The population figures for Temba include Tswaing.

4 The information contained in this section is taken from key informant interviews with members of the Demarcation Board.

5 For a more detailed description of projects that have been successful in reducing youth crime see Palmary & Moat (2002). Preventing Criminality Among Young People.

10. References


11. Appendix 1: Map of Tshwane

12. Appendix 2: List of Interviews

The following people were interviewed for this research. Specific details have not been given to preserve anonymity:

- Five traditional leaders
- Six SAPS station commissioners
- 2 members of the Demarcation Board
• Nine community based initiatives (in some cases, information had already been collected and interviews were therefore not necessary)
• Several representatives from ODI court
• Three metropolitan police regional commanders

© Centre for the Study of Violence and Reconciliation